

MINUTES OF THE DAVIESS COUNTY PUBLIC LIBRARY DISTRICT
BOARD OF TRUSTEES MONTHLY MEETING
August 20, 2025

Members Present: Susan Montalvo-Gesser, President; Rodney Ellis, Treasurer; Kathi Mattas, Secretary; Kevin Dorth; Al Mattingly.

Others Present: Erin Waller, Director; Debbie Young, Business Manager; Commissioner Janie Marksberry, Fiscal Court Liaison.

At 5:01 pm, President Montalvo-Gesser called the meeting to order in the 2nd floor public lounge.

President Montalvo-Gesser called for approval of the July minutes. Al Mattingly made the motion to approve, Kevin Dorth seconded, and the motion carried.

Rodney Ellis presented the Treasurer's Report. Kathi Mattas motioned to approve, Al Mattingly seconded, and the motion carried. Next, Mr. Ellis explained the Fiscal Year 2025/2026 Tax Rates, and recommended accepting the compensating tax rate (5.40 cents per \$100), while keeping the prior year rate for Tangible Personal Property, Aircraft, Watercraft and Inventory (6.20 cents per \$100). The rate for Motor Vehicles will stay the same at 4.0 cents per \$100. Al Mattingly motioned to approve the rates, Kathi Mattas seconded, and the motion carried. The approved rates will be sent to the Daviess County Fiscal Court.

Erin Waller gave the Director's Report, including:

1. Over 1,400 active participants in the summer reading program logged over 1,000,000 minutes in reading time.
2. The roofing work has been completed, but still waiting for gutters and metal work. The rental houses are nearly done.
3. There is a quote on hail damage repair for the library's newer vehicle; the wait is 2 years out.
4. Applications for two library board positions were sent to KDLA, which has sent its recommendations to the Fiscal Court.

Old Business -- Second Reading: Request for Reconsideration Policy

Two parts: (1) the Request for Reconsideration (RFR) policy, and (2) the RFR form.

As second reading and discussion of the policy began, President Montalvo-Gesser stated that the board would discuss and vote on individual portions and bullet points one at a time in order to finalize the complete new policy.

The first discussion of the policy involved the top of the document through the 2nd bullet point. The option "The Library will consider one RFR at a time. Requests will be reviewed on a first come, first

served basis. And only 2 titles will be reviewed at a time" was motioned by Mattingly, seconded by Ellis, and passed 4-1 (nay vote by Mattas).

The second discussion of the policy was from the third bullet point regarding the criteria for an RFR to be considered. Ellis motioned to accept it as written, seconded by Dorth, and passed unanimously.

The third discussion of the policy was of the 4th bullet point. The option "To ensure that each RFR is given appropriate attention, the Admin is able to consider one RFR from a patron per quarter" was motioned by Montalvo-Gesser, seconded by Mattingly, and passed 4-1 (nay vote by Mattas).

The fourth discussion of the policy was the fifth bullet point, and regarding the Ad Hoc committee there was the added words of "a minimum of three library staff." This was motioned by Mattas, seconded by Mattingly, and passed unanimously.

The fifth discussion of the policy was the sixth-eighth bullet points, including a change of thirty (30) days to ten (10 days) made to the sixth point. This was motioned by Mattas, seconded by Dorth, and passed unanimously.

The sixth discussion of the policy was the ninth bullet point. Option #2, which read, "If the patron is unsatisfied with the decision, the patron may appeal the Request for Reconsideration of Materials by asking in writing that it be referred to a review committee made up of two board members (serving for one quarter) and three randomly selected library staff members." This was motioned by Mattingly, seconded by Ellis, and passed 3-2 (nay votes by Mattas and Dorth).

The seventh discussion of the policy was the tenth and eleventh bullet points. This was motioned by Ellis, seconded by Dorth, and passed unanimously.

The final discussion of the policy was the twelfth bullet point. Option #2, with a change from 18 months to 6 months, "after the final decision is reached," was motioned by Mattas, seconded by Ellis, and passed 4-1 (nay vote by Mattingly).

Lastly, the Board discussed the RFR patron form options. Kathi Mattas motioned to approve adding a 6th question to Option 1, regarding what the patron suggests the library do with the item/title. Mattingly seconded, and the motion carried. Kathi Mattas motioned to approve the amended Option 1 RFR form, seconded by Kevin Dorth & Al Mattingly, and the motion carried.

Susan Montalvo-Gesser noted that the new policy was now finished and approved. Kathi Mattas asked if this was final, as her understanding from a previous explanation was that there would be a first reading at one meeting, a second reading at a second meeting, and a final vote on the finished policy at a third meeting. Commissioner Marksberry asked to comment on this, regarding how such was handled by the Fiscal Court, and her request was denied.

At 5:22, Rodney Ellis requested a recess, which was granted. The meeting resumed a few minutes later.

New Business – Second Floor Remodel and Discussion of "Sold" Book

Second Floor Remodel: From six bidders, the low bid of \$495,000 came from Danco, who has worked with DCPL before. Danco has confidence in the specs and 180 day time frame. After discussion, Rodney Ellis motioned to approve the bid, seconded by Al Mattingly, and the motion carried. Erin Waller said she would let the board know the start date once it is determined.

Discussion of Full Board Voting on Disputed Books --

According to Roberts Rules of Order, a tie vote means "no action," so there will be no further action on tie votes, such as was the case with Kisses for Jet.

Discussion of "Sold" Book –

After discussion and differing opinions offered by board members, Al Mattingly motioned to accept the review committee's decision to keep Sold in the YA collection. Susan Montalvo-Gesser seconded the motion, and it carried with a 3 - 2 vote (nays Mattas and Dorth).

Public Comment –

Susan Montalvo-Gesser called for public comment at 6:24 pm. There were approximately 60 people in attendance, with about 50 in the room and 10 standing outside the door.

Marilyn Van Winkle stated that there had been many book challenges targeting intellectual freedom and overloading library staff in order to "disrupt and control." She said the board should stand firm, limit the number of active RFR's per person, and added that the public library is not a culture war battleground.

Michael Hamlet thanked the board for efforts trying to create a good environment for our community's youth, stating that "pornography is a poison" -- even an image or text of such is poison. Such books could be kept anywhere in the library except the children and youth collections.

Zachary Whear apologized for misidentifying a book he spoke about previously. He noted that moving Adult Fiction downstairs does not resolve the issue of sexually explicit books being placed where minors pass by, demonstrated by his having picked up a book displayed right by the information desk, from which he read a sexually explicit passage out loud.

James L. Kamuf appreciates every board member's efforts. He was impressed and grateful at how improved the computers and related services are. He asked for copies of the meeting agenda to be made available to the public. (Note: Erin explained that the agenda is posted on the library's website 24 hours prior to each meeting.)

Susan Dunlap, former member of the Woodford Co. board of directors, enjoys visiting other libraries to see their offerings. She suggested DCPL add a "tool lending" service.

Clint Elliott introduced himself as an attorney representing a Daviess County resident, while not a Daviess County resident himself. President Montalvo-Gesser explained that, as a non-resident, he could not speak in public comment. He indicated that he would be sending a letter.

Sue Richards said that for months the board has been pressured by "a group" to pull books from children's reach, although the library offers a restricted youth card and review committees. She said that they seek control, are arrogant, "believe they can dictate what others can read," and that library principles mean access for everyone.

Abby Matthews said "a certain group" in town posted on social media that they have a list of 20 books in the library's RFR process that they emailed to their members. She had printouts of their post and comments. So, other patrons asked the library for that list, but were told it was not available to the public. She asked how one group got this list that others are denied, suggesting that confidential information is being shared with a select group who has clearly come out on one side of the issue. She noted the unfairness of this and asked if the list is public or private? (She handed a copy of her printout to Erin Waller.)

Kevin Whear thanked the board for their service, stating "do not fear." He asked about live-streaming meetings or getting a bigger room to accommodate the public. He spoke of not placing faith for book selection and location in just KDLA, ALA, and library professionals with degrees, but to also consider the input of parents. He urged the board to protect the children and not make lgbtq "the order of the day," but rather "freedom of corruption" for our children.

Trey Matthews thanked the board for their continued service. He referenced someone's earlier remark about "copy and paste speeches," noting that he does his own comments. He stated that credential shaming and condescension towards those without library degrees was not good, that he can discern inappropriate content in children's material for himself without such a degree.

Andy Gamblin expressed concern for children, as a former 21-year school bus monitor and school custodian, who had walked children across streets at their stops "to protect them." He noted the spiritual warfare, that God made men and women, and commended Commissioner Marksberry for her efforts to get inappropriate books out of the children's department.

Commissioner Janie Marksberry asked, regarding discussion about book content, "What else does a book have but content?" She also noted that her earlier attempted point was that with two seats opening on the board, a policy vote should have been tabled till the new board was seated. She asked why new policy was being pushed through really fast, "What is the rush?"

Al Mattingly announced that the next day would be his and his wife's 54th wedding anniversary.

Susan Montalvo-Gesser announced she will be speaking at OCTC on September 15 at 12:30 pm for Constitution Day.

President Montalvo-Gesser adjourned the meeting at 6:53pm.

The next meeting of the Daviess County Public Library Board of Trustees will be held at 5:00 pm on Wednesday, September 17, 2025, in the second floor public lounge.

